

ASSESSMENT THE MANAGEMENT' READINESS FOR PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP IN IRAQI PORTS AND IMPROVING THEIR CAPABILITY EFFECTIVENESS

Mohammed Abood Tahir¹, Abdoullah Kadim Mohammed²,
Beyda Mohammed Alwan³

^{1,2}Shatt Al-Arab University College, Basra, Iraq

³Ministry of Planning, Baghdad, Iraq

Abstract

Basra Ports represent the only artery of Iraq, which contribute effectively to the development of the economic and social sectors. Despite the many existed research studies that dealt with the implementation public and private partnership (PPP) and their roles in achieving growth and development in the economic activities they were not adequately addressed the extent to which the performance and capability the management of PPP projects in the ports of Iraq were evaluated and determined their problems. This study aims to design a frame work for assessment the readiness the management of PPP projects in Iraq's ports, and how to improve their performance in order to enhance the PPP contributions in economic development. The study investigated the perceptions of a sample of 76 managers of ministries of planning , transportation , general Company for ports Of Iraq and PPP decision makers in order to evaluate and assessment the readiness of the management of public private partnerships in Iraqi ports by designing questionnaires and then investigated all 57 managers of these PPP in order to illustrate problems which obstacle their work and improve the performance of their Companies of partnership projects contracting with Basra general company for ports(BGCP)of Iraq. The output was Shown that the readiness of the management of PPP was below the acceptable level and suggested which determined by World Bank and suggested ways to address the PPP for enhancing and to be more effective in the process of economic development in Iraq and can manage and bid for developing the Grand Al Faw port which will be the greatest port in the middle east , the research illustrated problems facing the PPP and suggested ways to

tackled the problems in order that PPP will be more capable for operating ports process .

Keywords: Economic Development, General Company, Basra Ports, Public Private, Partnership, PPP, Readiness, BGCP, Performance.

1. Introduction

Partnership projects between public and private (PPP) sectors are vital important for managing ports and providing the necessary logistic services for this reason most countries are considered the their ports are the most important (Nguyen and Notteboom ,2017),(ESCWA and ISDB,2019) that lead to analyze ways to improve the management and determine the Critical Success factors of the PPP (USAID,2017),(Aerts et al, 2014) thus will lead to develop an efficient Maritime Transport Projects(Deasher,2019) .

PPP can be defined according to Bisbey (2019) as one of the methods that encourage the private sector to participate in the economic and social development process and promote a cycle in sustainable projects. On the other hand, partnership contracts can be defined as a flexible and dynamic method in order to achieve development economic goals in all fields (Nasori and Sahar ,2017), (Islamic development bank,2019).

Partnership projects have great importance and benefits in the Process of Economic and Social development (Aldhabi and Ullah, 2022), (Fabre and Straab,2021) Which are:

- Distribution of risks with the private sector
- Improving the level of services.
- Ensuring the speedy implementation of projects.
- Providing job opportunities.
- Reducing government spending.
- Providing capital for other strategic projects.
- Getting financing outside the budget.
- Promoting the principle of equality and transparency.
- Promoting innovation and creativity.
- Promoting decentralization in decision-making.

There are many areas of partnership projects in the world, including (World Bank,2018) :

- The transport sector, ports and airports.

- Electricity production sector.
- Water resources management.
- Waste recycling.
- The education sector.
- The health care sector.

Security sector.

Ports are important transport outlets, commercial stations, and border gates in any country. Countries that include large and developed ports have important commercial activity that contributes to raising their economies as a result of the trade exchange witnessed by these ports, PPP projects in Ports have a great impact on the Economic Development providing better efficiency in services and operations assets (Aldhab and Ullah,2022) , also PPP will improve Ports resources (World Bank,2020) especially for developing countries such as Iraq (Islamic development bank,2019)

In 1919 Basra port was developed and equipped with complete equipment for its operation, sheds and warehouses were established, in 1922, the ports management became under the supervision of the Ministry of Finance, and then, in 1931, the Iraqi ports became independent according to Law No (40) in the 1956 and in the year 1978 the ports became a public facility (Basra general company for ports,2018).

Then the BGCP in Iraqi was established under the Public Companies Law No. 22 of 1997 after the development of ports in Iraq, the increase in their number, and the increase in their facilities, services and nature now BGCP consists the following Ports (Basra general company for ports,2023).

- Umm Qaser North Port
- Umm Qaser South Port
- Khur AlZubair Port
- Abu Floose Port
- Maqil Port
- The Grand Al Faw Port (under construction which will be the biggest Port in the middle east (Deasher,2019),(Al-Juboori,215).

The law was emendation for the year 2004, that the field is open to enter into partnerships with local and international companies. Later in 2010 The partnership with Iraqi private sector was activated and confirmed the creation of a suitable environment for the private sector to establish a true partnership between the government and

the private sector and share risks between them and to be managed by experienced people in this field

The shift towards the private sector in ports operating in general was the result of two main factors: the significant growth in the level of global trade encouraged private sector investors in the field of ports and achieving a high level of efficiency under the private sector encouraged ships dealing with these ports due to lower costs of operating ships in them, the second factor is that increasing the carrying capacity of ships, especially container ships, requires ports equipped with various advanced requirements in terms of equipment as well as efficient management to meet the challenges of competing ports. The number of private sector companies contracting with the BGCP of Iraq in partnership contracts has reached 37 companies. Most of these companies manage loading and unloading operations and sidewalk management, PPP is one of the means to reduce the pressure on the BGCP budget through the use of the capabilities of the private sector, whether financing, technical, administrative or advisory capabilities.

Iraq is working for increasing the capacity of Basra Ports Basra general company for ports,2023), through the project of The Grand Al Faw Port, so the BGCP has invited local and International Private companies to submit bids for contract to manage and operate the new terminal at Umm Qasr Port (Basra general company for ports,2018),(Chechurina and Grin,2020).

2. Research problem formulation

2.1 The Problems

The issue of PPP is the most important in the field of Comprehensive Economic Development and important sources of funding, therefore after 2003 the Iraqi Government gave attention and priority to implementing Partnership Projects in all Operations of the BGCP of Iraq because this company is one of the greatest important for development all economic and social sectors in Iraq, then after 2010 there were 37 PPP companies contracted with Ministry of Transportation for Operation the Process of many Oil and Commercial Ports but in spite of importance of PPP the BGCP facing problems of whether PPP can cope with expansions of Ports in long term planning .

Structured Interviews were organized by the Researchers with some Decision Makers in the Ministry of Planning, the Ministry of Transport and PPP in BGCP, it was concluded that the PPP are contributed greatly to improve the level of performance of the Ports operations and an important source of funding for the Ministry of Transport but

at the same time these PPP are required more effort to improve their readiness level in order to be capable for the present and future expansion in all the Iraqi Ports .

The problem can be summarized as:

- Failure to follow a system of evaluating and assessment the readiness of the PPP management for expansion and developing Ports of the Grand Al Faw Port
- These projects face legal and regulatory problems that may affect their operations process effectively
- PPP is not much practiced, which created a lack of clear vision for the concerned parties which led negatively to improve their performance

2.2 Research importance

The importance of the research lies in addressing the concept of partnership between government agencies and the private sector. It also clarifies the criteria and requirements for the successful application of such partnership in government institutions, such as the BGCP in Iraq in the Ministry of Transport. The research importance also stems in how to find solution for the problem of these companies raise the performance and capability level for the better development. It is believed that the best option for Iraq's recovery from any economic crisis is the government's adoption of the partnership in the development process.

2.3 Research Objectives

Determining the concept of PPP, indicating the strengths and weaknesses that characterize them, and adopting scientific methods in assessment the readiness of their management is one of the important goals of this research, and then identifying and analyzing the most important obstacles that may lead to the inefficiency of Partnership Projects in the long term operation of Iraqi ports.

The framework for achieving the research objectives will be consisting the following stages:

Stage one:

designing a questioner for evaluating and assessing the readiness of managing the PPP according to the models designed by the United Nations and the World Bank, while doing important modifications to be suitable for the Iraqi environment, the outcome of this questioner will lead whether PPP which working in Ports of Iraq have capability in contribution in the projects of the Grand Al-Faw Port

Stage two:

Designing a questioner to determine the main problem that these companies facing which can be consider as critical failure factors of the PPP' management of operation process

Stage three:

Find the main success factors for the PPP in Iraq in order to be more effective

Stage four:

Designing a framework for operation PPP in the long term planning of the Grand Al Faw Port and other Port

2.4 Research rationale

Due to the lack of previous studies and research specialized in managing PPP in Iraq in general, Port of Iraq urgently needs for research in the field of PPP which is considered one of the successful solutions that will contribute to enhancing the economics of Iraq. The study will add Knowledge in the field of PPP and will contribute to add value to the Ports of Iraq.

2.5 Research hypothesis development

Based on the procedures that was used by Abdullah and Al-Abrow (Abdullah and Al-Abrow,2022) and Mohammed and Al-Abrow (Mohammed and Al-Abrow,2022) the following Hypothesis are formulated

2.5.1 Testing the level of readiness of the PPP management

Ho: null hypotheses, the level of the Management of PPP Readiness is

acceptable according to the determined level by the World Bank which was not less

than 3 which average level , i.e.

$H_0: \mu \geq \mu_0$

$H_a: \mu < \mu_0$ where $\mu_0 = 3$

decision: We reject the Null Hypothesis and accept the alternative hypotheses if the

calculated value of t- statistic falls in the critical region at $\alpha = 5\%$, critical region is

between $(-\infty$ and $-1.645)$

calculated $t = \frac{(\bar{m} - \mu_0)}{(s/(n-1))^{0.5}}$... (1)

where

m = calculated mean of the responders

s = standard deviation

n = sample size = 76 in this case

theoretical t-statistic = -1.645 with $\mu=0.5$ and
degree of freedom

$$(n-1) = 75$$

2.5.2 Testing answers of responders ($n = 57$ in this case) to
determine the current

problems of the PPP

H_0 : null hypotheses, the Management of PPP affected by
problem i ($i=1$ to 8) was not

less 3, where 3 is the agree/not agree scale than $\mu_0 \geq 3$, i.e.

$H_0: \mu \geq \mu_0$ at 95% confidence limit

H_a : alternative hypotheses, reject the null hypotheses if
calculated value of t

statistics falls in the Critical region, calculated t can be found
by equation (1)

3. literature review

3.1 Public Private Partnership Projects

Partnership contracts appeared at the beginning of the nineties of the last century in order to provide infrastructure and all activities (Hamodna,2017) The partnership represented by long-term contracts between the public and private sectors, is one of the forms of cooperation between the public and private sectors[10] .The goal of partnership contract is to provide public services and establish infrastructure by benefiting from the efficiency of the private sector, its financial capabilities and expertise UN ESCAP,2016).

It is not a partnership with capital, nor is it a partnership with profits only, but it is a partnership with risks as well. This is the most important feature that distinguishes partnership contracts from the rest of the other contracts. The public sector transfers to the private sector some of the risks of the project whereas the role of the government becomes limited to regulation and control. Still in other types of partnership, the public and private sectors bear all kinds of risks. Likewise, what distinguishes the partnership contracts from the

rest of the other contracts is the determination of the outputs of the project instead of the inputs. In the sense that the state does not buy or build at its own expense.

3.2 Types of Public Private Partnership Projects

There are many types of partnership project contracts (ESCWA and ISDB,2019) (Deasher,2019) but the most important are

- Service contracts

It is one of the contracts represented by binding agreements of limited duration, including contracts for the operation of water supply stations.

- Management contracts

They are contracts of agreement through which private sector companies manage the electric power production stations

- Contracts of lease

They are the contract that enable the lease of state assets to the private sector, and the private sector companies bear the risks, and among its applications are partnership projects in the public sector.

- Concession contracts

They are the fuel through which the operation and development rights are transferred to the beneficiary, and among these projects is the railway administration.

- Long-term contract

Build-Operate-Transfer (BOT) contracts

Build-Own-Operate-Transfer (BOOT) contracts

Build-Own-Operate (BOO) contracts

3.3 The experiences of implementing PPP

Some countries were able to achieve economic growth and sustainable development due to the implementation of partnership projects in the management of seaports. PPP as a modern form of public-private cooperation enables port systems to increase their efficiency and establish their port services on a commercial basis despite limited public funding. The inclusion of the private sector in port operations directly affects their management models. Solving the problem of modernizing Croatian ports and achieving their sustainable development goals. Results indicate that timely analysis of the port environment and key port performance indicators is a prerequisite for strategic planning of some Croatian port systems at the regional and national levels. In this way, a better implementation of investment projects will be achieved and will contribute to

increasing the growth and development of the port system. There are countries that have good experiences in developing dry ports, through partnership contracts. They were able to provide the current dry port system with a lot of facilities, rapid transportation and the lowest costs. Among these countries:

- Building PPP model and implemented for the sea Ports in Croatia (Iblak and Jugovic,2013)
- Implemented PPP model for dry port in Vietnam (Nguyen and Notteboon,2019)
- developing successful PPP for Transport Project in Botswana (Jonga, 2021)
- studying the failure of PPP in Dandong of China (Feng, Grifell and Yang,2021)
- Experiences adopted by the World Bank and the United Nations in developing some ports in the world (Hamoda,2017) ,(US department of transport,2007) which are:-
- The experience of developing Al-Aqedah port in Jordan.
- Experience of developing the port of Aden in Yemen.
- Experience of developing the port of Lagos in Nigeria
- Experience of developing the port of Rijeka in Croatia.
- Experience of developing the ports of Chile, Colombia and Peru.

Private contractors through PPP can minimize risk of project failure and improved the quality of service (Iblak and Jugovic,2013), so there are many Researches paper were tackled problems in order to improve the efficiency of PPP or focusing on how to develop Critical Success Factors for PPP

(Al Rashid,2014),(Aerta et al,2014)

4. Questioner designing, Data collections and statistical analysis

4.1 questioner designing for evaluation the readiness:

The researchers were relied on the Questioner forms for evaluation which designed by the World Bank (World Bank,2013) and the United Nations ESCAP (UN ESCAP,2016),(Iraq port assessment,2023) and was redesigned in order to fit and acceptable for Iraqi environment also was arbitration by 20 Academic Professors in the Iraqi Universities, the Questioners form was divided into eight variables or factors, each variable includes questions . The questionnaire translated to English languages for the foreigner responders and designed through which all questions can be

answered by the decision makers who are informed and have an understanding the PPP Environment and Operations of Iraqi Ports and can discuss their common views The Questioner consists the following main variables: -

- general PPP environment variable in BGCP

This part focuses on issues related to the general investment environment in the country and includes variables on the macroeconomic, business climate, financial, legal and government environment

- The political and social variable in Iraq

The indicators in this factor refer to the political and social adequacy understanding.

- The legal and transparency variable Indicators in this framework measure whether the legal environment was sufficient for the implementation of PPP projects in Iraq and the transparency of all contract procedures

- The financial management variable

This aspect deals with the economic feasibility and all financial issues related to the partnership project.

- The executive and controlling variable

This variable deals with the evaluation of all life cycle phases of the PPP project.

- Contracting Management variable

In this factor, the general contracting management of the partnership project will be highlighted.

- The capability management variable

This aspect deals with the capability of operation PPP in the province of Basra and accept the idea of partnership and foreign employment.

- Risk management variable

The aim for this questioner is to find out if there is a study by the company about analyzing the risk that affect the implementation of PPP projects in the ports. (Ravi,2019) Questioner variables are shown in appendix 1.

The research population is represented by the (76) managers of the Private sector and Public sectors who involved in the management of the PPP in Ports of Iraq. The number of managers of the companies contracting with the ports of Iraq reached 37 companies, and the number of officials in the Ports of Iraq Company and Transportation

and Planning Ministries reached 39 managers. These managers were interviewed and visits were held to them at work sites.

The researchers used the scale approved by WORLD BANK (PPP Guide version 2), which ranges from (1-5). 5 represents very good, 4 is good, 3 is average, 2 is fair, and 1 is poor. Value 3 was chosen as a boundary line between acceptable and unacceptable Level for evaluations.

Data were collected through the questioners which distributed to all of this research responders and entered into the MINITAP Software (Evans,2022) for testing the hypothesis as shown in Table 1.

Table 1 Statistical analysis

variables		Mean	Standard deviation	calculated value of t	Decisions
1	general environment	1.9733	.79594	-9.215	reject the null hypothesis
2	political and social situation in Iraq	1.9500	.84621	-10.880	reject the null hypothesis
3	Legal and transparency	2.4852	.99191	-4.550	reject the null hypothesis
4	contracting procedures	2.4556	.72776	-5.213	reject the null hypothesis
5	financial management	2.0667	.1.14226	-.255	accept the null hypothesis
6	contract implementing procedures	3.1667	.72100	2.028	accept the null hypothesis
7	capability	3.0500	.65602	0.6685	accept the null hypothesis
8	risk management	2.2533	1.00986	-.412	accept the null hypothesis

It could be shown in table 1 that the value of calculated t- statistics for General Partnership, Political Situation in Iraq ,legal and Contracting variables were fell in rejected zone which were less than theoretical value of t–statistic ($t=-1.645$) and the management needed to be improved their performance within the scale of World Bank Assessment while other variables were fell in the accepted zone which means were acceptable level of readiness and the management performance were capable for performing their operation process through Financial, Implementing Procedures, Capability and Risk Management .

4.2. Designing Questioner for diagnosis PPP problems: -

To provide a diagnostic tool to identify the main problem factors that PPP facing which should be identified and proposed solution in order to that the Private Partner be more active and for operation the Ports and to be more effectiveness for operating the process in their field of project ,researchers had conducted meeting and interviews with 12 top managers in the ministries' of planning and transportation which led to 8 possible variables which could be the most critical variables facing the management of the PPP in Iraq which also mentioned in (Al-Juboori,2015) ,(Hamzah et al ,2013), each variable determined by a number of questions. the questioner was arbitrated by academic professors as shown in appendix 2

The research population size for this stage is represented by the (56) managers who represented private and public decision makers of the 37 PPP in Port of Iraq

The researchers used the scale which ranges from (1-5). 5 represents strongly agreement , , 4 is agreement , 3 is neutral , 2 is disagree , and 1 is strongly disagree . Value 3 was chosen as a boundary line between agree and disagree.

Data were collected through the questioners which distributed to all of research responders and entered into the MINITAP SOFTWARE for testing the hypothesis as shown in Table 2.

Table 2 Statistical analysis

	variables	Mean	Standard deviation	calculated value of t	decisions
1	Procedures	2.934	0.7654	-0.6396	accept the null hypotheses
2	Political	2.852	0.8650	-1.2692	accept the null hypotheses
3	legal	2.981	1.4302	-.09855	accept the null hypotheses
4	Financial Management	3.567	1.2564	3.3462	accept the null hypotheses
5	Control Management	3.560	0.9873	4.2063	accept the null hypotheses
6	Information Technology	3.755	0.9853	5.6826	accept the null hypotheses
7	Environment	3.321	1.0021	2.3755	accept the null hypotheses

8	Risk Management	3.463	1.4321	2.3976	accept the null hypotheses
---	-----------------	-------	--------	--------	----------------------------

It was shown in table 2 that all variables (procedures, political, legal, financial management, control management, information technology, environment and risk management) were fell in acceptable zone which meant that these variables were the main critical problem causes) to the capability and performance of the PPP in ports of Iraq and must be considered by the authority in order to find solution for it.

5. Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

- The experiences of the countries of the world, especially the countries that suffer from financial crises, the partnership in the ports sector are among the experiences that contributed to accelerating the development process witnessed by these countries.
- The experience of the GCP in Iraqi is a pioneering experience in the field of partnership contracts in Iraq, and it has achieved returns and revenues that this company would not be able to achieve previously.
- The GCP in Iraqi was able to achieve success in partnership contracts because of its administrative leadership and the provision of an appropriate environment, and the vision drawn by this company in developing freight and unloading operations and services in the ports of Umm Qasr and Khor Al-Zubayr.
- Through the application of the evaluation form, we can conclude that the management of the partnership in the ports of Iraq is still below the required level according to the standards of the World Bank, and this gives us an indication that it requires efforts by all parties to improve this management for the better.
- Most problems facing the management of the partnership are represented by the lack of a law regulating the partnership contracts in a better way and the complex investment procedures that are followed in Iraq.

5.2 Recommendations and proposal for further work

- It is recommended that the following proposed solution in order to improve the performance and capability of the PPP Management which has been discussed with the top management of the PPP in Ports of Iraq as shown in table 3

Table 3 Proposals solution for the PPP

Variable	Proposals to improve the performance from the point of view of Decision Makers of PPP in Port of Iraq
general procedures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The percentage of employment of local workers must be determined in the partnership contracts in order to satisfy the local community with the partnership with the private sector companies • Involving of competent administrative leaders in the public sector to manage the projects involved with the private sector at a better level. • Training employees in the partnership management to enhance their administrative capabilities • Indulging information technology and electronic management in the operations of partnership projects • Formulating special standards for the advancement of institutional performance • Creating a safe environment to attract investment in partnership projects • Drafting laws to protect investors and strengthen partnership with the guarantees of government • Monitoring the performance of the private sector • There must be global openness to sober companies that are evaluated by the World Bank • Securing a safe environment for private sector companies.
The Political	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adopting decentralization in decision-making and not relying on the center • Setting controls for the implementation of projects by successive governments • Staying away from political differences because of their impact on partnership projects; strengthening the institutional role • Granting powers to the local residence department to grant residence permits to foreign employees • Clear strategic plans for partnership projects.
Legal and Transparency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Drafting a special law for partnership projects and circulating it to Iraqi embassies • Granting full powers to the directors of the public sector in managing and supervising partnership projects • Activating a special insurance law for companies working in partnership projects • Early announcement of partnership projects that the state intends to contract with private sector companies • Reducing unnecessary procedures in managing partnership projects • Involving Iraqi universities in evaluating partnership projects. • Issuing legislation or instructions to protect private sector companies
Financial Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Central Bank shall grant sovereign guarantees to private sector

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> companies Drafting a special law for partnership projects that includes instructions for lending and financial transfer Developing good governance controls in managing partnership projects Preparing economic feasibility studies according to the mechanisms used in the United Nations instructions for partnership projects Developing financial institutions, customs laws, taxes and financial transfers to encourage participation of companies.
Control Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Drafting special instructions for the implementation of tender evaluation, negotiation and contracting procedures in partnership projects Periodic evaluation of partnership projects by Iraqi universities Exchanging of experiences between the administrations of public and private sector. Supporting senior management for partnership projects in ports
Information Technology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing a specialized department in the public sector to manage partnership projects Organizing periodic procedures for evaluating partnership projects by the public and private sectors Enhancing administrative capabilities to manage partnership projects Developing information technology in the administrative work of the public sector.
The social environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing a plan to enhance the role of society in the success of partnership projects Developing a plan to protect foreign employees The partnership contracts must include a percentage of local employees Organizing procedures for the private sector to assume social obligations.
Risk analysis framework	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organizing a specialized department to analyze the risks in the all fields. Developing the risk analysis department for projects, which gives indicators of any failure or risks in projects.

• In order to PPP be more successful and capable for operating projects in the ports of Iraq, a model is required to manage the operations of these projects, as many of these models were designed according to the experiences of countries, private sector companies and the work environment. However, due to the limited experiences of Iraq in the field of partnership projects, thus the researchers recommended to that the World Bank model (Baxter,2016) to be adopted for Iraq.

The model was presented to the members of the Partnership Committee in the

Ministry of Planning and was modified some steps, the proposed framework

consists 4 stages which are: -

The first stage

This stage includes studying the following issues:

- Formulating the problems facing the ports.
- Studying the ways that develops the port operations.
- Strategic planning to develop port operations.
- Formulating the strategic objectives for port development projects.
- Determining the resources needed to operate the projects.
- Studying the financial requirements of projects.
- Formulating action plans.

The second stage

This stage includes studying the following issues:

- Studying the priority of projects.
- Studying the ways to implement projects.
- An integrated study of project risk management.
- A preliminary study to consider the projects as partnership projects.
- Preliminary evaluation of the partnership project.
- Studying the economic and technical feasibility of the partnership project.
- Studying the financial return of the project.
- Referring the project to the Economic Committee in the General Secretariat of the Council of Ministers.
- Approval of the Economic Committee on the partnership project.

The third stage

At this stage, the following issues are studied:

- Formulating techniques for measuring project performance at all stages.
- Organizing a contracting department.
- Using technology in announcing the project.
- Managing tenders.
- Evaluating the performance of the private sector companies that applied to implement the project.

- The legal regulation of all operations related to risk management and ways to solve problems that may be encountered when managing the project.
- Preliminary approval.

The fourth stage

At this stage:

- Final approval of the private sector partnership in managing the project.
- Financial control and performance of the project management.
- Risk management in the project life cycle.

Bibliography

- Abdullah Hassan Oudah and Al-Abrrow Hadi (2022)
Predicting positive and negative behaviors at the workplace: Insights from multi-faceted perceptions and attitudes, wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/joe, Wiley periodicals. LLC
- Aerts Geoffrey, Thies Grage, Michael Doods and Haezen Donck Elvira (2014)
Public Private Partnership for the Provision of Port Infrastructure: An Explorative Multi Actor perspective on Critical Success Factors, *The Asian Journal of Shipping and logistic*, vol. 30 , n0 3, Dec. 2014 pp 273-298
- Aldhabi Faisal Amur Said and Ullah Assad (2022)
The Role of the Public-Private Partnership in achieving the Optimal Economic and Social Benefits Through the Port sector, *International Journal of Management Science and Business Administration*, vol. 18 , issue 5 , pp 57-65
- Al-Guboori Omar Akrm Abd Alwahab (2015)
Condition for applying Public-Private Partnership in Iraq Infrastructure Project successfully, PhD thesis, University Munchen
- Al Rashid Ahmed Ali (2014)
Opportunities for Private Sector to Participate for development in Port of Iraq by using AHP, *Economic Science Journal* ,University of Basra , Iraq
- Basra General Company for Ports (2018)
Available on line , www.cia.gov
- Basra General Company for Ports (2023)
Information about BGCP
Available on <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki>
- Baxter D. (2016)
PPP contract management Institute for PPP
Dubai International Project management Forum,
www.dipmf.ae
- Canh Nguyen Lam and Notteboom Theo (2017)
Public Private Partnership Model selection for Dry Port Development: an application to Vietnam, *Word review of International Transportation Research*
- Chechurina N. and Grin A. (2020)
Public-Private Partnership in management of Port of the World, 5th International Conference "Arctic" history and modernity IOP Publishing

- Deasher Assad Saeed (2019) Impact of umm Qaser Port on Iraq Trading, MSc thesis, World Maritime University
- Dubai Government (2010) Partnership between the public and the private sector. Dubai: Department of Economic and Financial Studies
- ESCWA and ISDB (2019) Public Private Partnership for Ports Development and Operation, final report based on the outcomes of the Expert Group meeting implementing on Jordan
- Evans Michael and Cathylene St (2022) Minitab manual, university of Toronto
- Fabre Anais and Straab Stephane (2021) The impact of Public-Private Partnership in infrastructure in health and education, working paper, Toulouse School of Economics no. 98
- Feng Hengxiang, Grifell Manel and Yang Zhong Zhen (2021) Latest Challenges to PPP: case of Dandong Port (China) 's Bankruptcy, Transport Policy
- Hamodna Mohammed Ashraf (2017) Factors for Palestine Development by the Public view point, MSc thesis Algeria University, Algeria
- Hamzah Suharman, Adisasmita Saki A., Hartanto Tri, Pallu M. Saleh (2013) Private involvement in sustainable management of Indonesian port: need and strategy with PPP scheme, 4th international conference on sustainable future for human security, sustain 2013
- Iekha Ravi (2019) Public-Private Partnership in International Ports, the PPP experiences and the road ahead, international journal of innovation science and research technology , vol. 4 , issue 7
- Islamic Development Bank (2019) Public-Private Partnership for Development and Operation ,ISDB
- Iraq Port Assessment (2023) Available on <https://dica.loduster.org/display/public/2>
- Iblak Bisticic and Jugovic A. (2013) Public-Private Partnership Management Model of Croatian Seaports, Journal of Contemporary Management, issue 18(1) pp 79-102
- Jonga Glory k. (2021) Training workshop for developing successful Public-Private Partnership for increased Transport Connectivity in Botswana, un(OHRLLS
- Jyoti Bisbey (2019) Public Private Partnership for Sustainable Port Development Macro Policy and Financing for Development, UN
- Lobner Linda (2009) How well do Public Private Partnerships, MSc thesis, University of Vienna
- Mohammed Abbas Ali and Al –Abrrow Hadi (2022) The impact of empowering and transformational leadership on organizational performance and innovation: the mediating role of shared leadership and culture in the Iraqi healthcare sector, International journal of Organizational Analysis, Emerald Publication Limited
- Nasori Fazal Akram and Sahar Fazal Zedan (2017) Public Private Partnerships Project Implementation In Iraq, Economic Science Journal, Vol. 21, No. 82, University Of Baghdad
- Nguyen I. C. and Notteboon T. (2019) Public-Private Partnership Model selector for Dry Port development: an application to Vietnam, World Review of International Transportation Research ,6(2) pp 229-250

Journal of Namibian Studies, 33 S2(2023): 941–959 ISSN: 2197-5523 (online)

- UN ESCAP (2016) Public private partnership Readiness Assessments Documents.
<https://repository.unescap.org/handle/20.500.12870/3851>
- US Department of Transport (2007) User Guide book on Implementing Public-Private Partnership PPP for Transport
- USAID (2017) Public Private Partnerships for Transportation in the APEC Region, An Analysis and Literature Review, Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation
- World Bank (2018) Public-Private Partnership PPP Guide Version 2.
<http://documents.worldbank.org>
- World bank (2020) Government Objectives: Benefits and Risk of PPPs
<http://ppp.worldbank.org/public-private-partnerships/ppp-objectives>
- Word bank (2010) Public-Private Partnership PPP documents. Work order 05-002