

## Baccha Posh: A Controversial Cultural Phenomenon – Boon Or Curse

Shehnaz Parveen Ansari<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Deepika Dhand<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Research Scholar, Department of English, MATS University Raipur, Chhattisgarh.

<sup>2</sup>Research Guide, Department of English, MATS University Raipur, Chhattisgarh.

### Abstract

Baccha posh, a custom rooted in specific regions of Afghanistan and Pakistan, where families lacking sons opt to attire one of their daughters as a male, has ignited conversations on a global scale. This intricate cultural practice serves as a reflection of the intricate interplay of social, cultural, and gender norms, triggering discussions regarding its pros and cons. Advocates of Baccha posh argue that it can provide girls with new opportunities and liberties that are otherwise restricted in patriarchal societies. Conversely, critics view it as a perpetuation of gender disparities and a reinforcement of damaging stereotypes, contributing to the overall discourse on gender dynamics. The essence of Baccha posh lies in the tensions between tradition and modernity, tradition and progression, as people grapple with its implications in today's rapidly evolving world. These debates bring to light the complexities of cultural practices and their impact on gender equality, shedding light on the multifaceted nature of societal structures and beliefs. By examining Baccha posh through a critical lens, societies can navigate the nuances of gender identity and roles, striving towards a more inclusive and equitable future for all individuals, regardless of gender.

**Keywords:** Baccha posh, gender dynamics, cultural phenomenon, Afghanistan, Pakistan, gender inequality, social status, education, economic opportunities.

### Introduction:

In Afghanistan, women face a longstanding battle against patriarchy, a struggle that sets it apart from other nations worldwide. Throughout the past century, the ebbs and flows of political power in the country have been intrinsically linked to the fight for women's rights. In recent times, the plight of Afghan women has come into sharp focus under the strict rule of the Taliban. Their situation has often been used as a focal point by Western military powers as a rationale for intervention in the name of liberating women. Despite variations in the treatment of women across different

ethnicities and societal frameworks in Afghanistan, the underlying challenges they face share commonalities that transcend these differences.

In Afghanistan, the prevailing situation has led many families to feel concerned about the safety and well-being of their daughters. To address these worries, the practice of Bacha Posh has emerged as a viable solution. Bacha Posh involves temporarily transforming girls, typically around the age of 10 or 11, into boys, a period when they have begun to experience puberty. This practice, as highlighted by Nashimi, is a response to Afghanistan's patriarchal societal structure where men hold significant power and influence over various institutions. Despite this patriarchal setup, there have been ongoing efforts since 2001 to empower and uplift women in Afghan society. Positive strides and improvements have been observed, indicating progress in challenging the deep-rooted norms of discrimination against women. Overall, the transformative practice of Bacha Posh serves as a reflection of the complex dynamics at play in Afghan society, where gender roles and societal norms are constantly evolving amidst broader efforts to promote gender equality and address long-standing inequalities.

Baccha posh is a unique cultural practice deeply rooted in the traditions of specific regions within Afghanistan and Pakistan. This intriguing phenomenon involves families who, lacking sons, choose to dress one of their daughters as a boy, blurring the lines between gender identities. It has, without a doubt, generated widespread discussions globally, sparking debates on the intricate interplay of social constructs, cultural norms, and gender roles that underlie this practice. The act of Baccha posh serves as a symbol of the complexities and nuances within these societies, shedding light on the profound impact of traditions on individual and collective identities. The broader implications of this cultural tradition have pushed forward dialogues that delve into its potential benefits and drawbacks, showcasing the multifaceted nature of the issues at hand. As this practice continues to be a subject of scrutiny and contemplation across different cultural contexts, it remains a poignant reminder of the diversity and richness of human experiences worldwide. While some individuals argue that the integration of technology provides avenues for girls in patriarchal societies to access opportunities and freedoms that are typically restricted, there are also contrasting views that criticize this digital empowerment for potentially perpetuating existing gender inequalities and reinforcing detrimental stereotypes. Those in favor of technology's role in empowering girls highlight how access to information and communication tools can help bridge the gender gap and enable girls to pursue education and careers that were previously inaccessible to

them. On the other hand, critics express concerns that technology may inadvertently replicate societal biases and reinforce traditional gender roles, further entrenching discriminatory practices. This ongoing debate emphasizes the complex interplay between technology and gender dynamics, with advocates and critics alike recognizing the need for thoughtful reflection and proactive measures to ensure that digital advancements genuinely contribute to gender equality and empowerment rather than exacerbate existing challenges.

**Advantages of Baccha Posh:**

In societies where educational opportunities are limited for girls due to cultural and social restrictions, the strategic decision to dress a daughter as a boy can serve as a means of breaking down barriers and allowing her access to the valuable resources of schooling and learning that are often denied to females. By assuming a male appearance, she can transcend gender-based constraints and enter realms of knowledge and empowerment traditionally reserved for boys, thereby opening doors to increased literacy rates and fostering intellectual growth among girls who would otherwise have been excluded from such educational prospects. This transformative action not only provides these young girls with the tools and skills necessary to navigate a world that may have previously been inaccessible to them, but also promotes a shift towards gender equality by challenging and dismantling the systemic inequalities that have hindered their educational advancement. As a result, these formerly marginalized girls are empowered to reach their full potential, contribute meaningfully to their communities, and participate actively in shaping a brighter and more inclusive future for all. Thus, by leveraging the simple act of dressing a daughter as a boy as a mechanism for educational access, society can take a significant step towards paving the way for a more equitable and enlightened society where all individuals have the opportunity to thrive and succeed. Social Status: Having a son is often associated with higher social status and respect in conservative societies. Dressing a daughter as a boy can temporarily elevate the family's status in the community, providing them with certain privileges and recognition.

In societies characterized by male-dominated economic structures, where men hold more considerable access to employment and serve as the main providers for their families, the act of presenting a daughter as a son can be a strategic maneuver to navigate the confines of traditional gender roles and societal expectations. By leveraging the perception of the daughter as a son, doors that would typically remain closed to her due to gender discrimination and limited opportunities are unlocked, offering her pathways to economic independence and professional growth. This unconventional

strategy challenges the existing norms and biases that restrict women from fully participating in the workforce and asserts the importance of equal access to economic opportunities, irrespective of gender. Through this approach, not only does the daughter gain the chance to pursue avenues that were previously denied to her, but it also highlights the need for systemic changes to create a more equitable environment where individuals are evaluated based on their skills and merit, rather than on outdated gender stereotypes. Ultimately, the practice of presenting a daughter as a son serves as a potent reminder of the importance of challenging societal norms, promoting gender equality, and fostering a more inclusive and diverse workforce where talent and potential are celebrated without regard to gender.

In various conservative societies, it is not uncommon for boys to be given a higher degree of freedom of movement and independence compared to their female counterparts. This disparity can limit girls' ability to explore public spaces and engage in activities typically earmarked for boys. However, an interesting approach to addressing this inequality is by dressing a daughter in a manner that allows her to blend in as a boy. By adopting this strategy, parents may inadvertently provide their daughter with more opportunities to navigate public spaces without the societal constraints traditionally imposed on girls. This subtle change in attire can serve as a means of granting the daughter the autonomy and freedom of movement typically associated with boys in such conservative cultures. Through this unconventional method, parents are able to challenge social norms and offer their daughter a taste of the liberty often enjoyed by boys. Consequently, dressing a daughter as a boy opens up avenues for her to partake in a wider array of activities and experiences that would typically be out of reach for girls within these societal confines. Ultimately, this alternative approach may help bridge the gap in freedom of movement between boys and girls, presenting a potential solution for families seeking to provide their daughters with equal opportunities for exploration and self-discovery in restrictive cultural settings.

**Disadvantages of Baccha Posh:**

Reinforcement of Gender Inequality: Baccha posh, a custom where young girls in Afghanistan are temporarily raised as boys, inadvertently endorses the notion that sons hold more significance and worth over daughters, ultimately perpetuating entrenched gender disparities and elevating discrimination against girls. This practice not only deepens societal inequalities but also ingrains the belief that girls must forego their femininity to be valued and respected, illustrating a concerning narrative that sets conditions on a girl's identity and opportunities based on her gender. As girls partake in this

rite of passage, they are compelled to temporarily conform to societal expectations traditionally reserved for boys, which underscores the limited agency and empowerment accorded to them in a patriarchal society. In fostering such ideologies, Baccha posh not only reinforces gender-based hierarchies and biases but also imposes restrictive limitations on girls, constraining their ability to express themselves authentically and participate fully in society. By maintaining the charade of being male, girls inadvertently reinforce the deeply ingrained societal norms valuing masculinity over femininity, perpetuating a cycle that cements the subjugation and marginalization of women in Afghan society. This practice serves as a stark reminder of the systemic gender inequalities that continue to persist, emphasizing the need for broader social change to dismantle such harmful beliefs and behaviors that undermine the inherent worth and dignity of girls and women.

**Psychological Impact:** The profound impact of living as a different gender for an extended period during childhood and adolescence cannot be understated. This experience can create a complex web of psychological effects that deeply influence individuals' perceptions of self and the world around them. As they grapple with the challenges of conforming to societal norms while trying to understand and express their true identity, feelings of confusion and uncertainty can become profound and pervasive. The inner turmoil that arises from this internal conflict often manifests as identity crises, where individuals find themselves torn between societal expectations and their own authentic selves. This struggle to reconcile conflicting aspects of their identity can result in emotional distress and trauma, as they navigate a path towards self-acceptance and self-expression. Ultimately, the journey to self-discovery and acceptance in the face of societal pressures can be a tumultuous and arduous one for those who have lived through the experience of being a different gender during their formative years.

**Limited Agency:** Baccha posh, a practice that involves dressing and raising a girl as a boy in certain cultures, effectively strips away the fundamental agency and autonomy that girls should inherently possess. By coercing these girls into living a deceptive identity, it curtails their ability to authentically express themselves and exercise free will in shaping the course of their own lives. Instead of nurturing their individuality and honoring their personal aspirations, Baccha posh compels them to adhere to rigid societal standards and expectations, relegating their true essence to the sidelines. This denial of their inherent right to self-determination not only infringes upon their freedom but also undermines the very core of their being. These girls are essentially robbed of the opportunity to cultivate a genuine sense of selfhood, to

explore their own identities, and to make choices that reflect their innermost desires and ambitions. As a consequence, their bodies and minds become battlegrounds where external norms and pressures govern, stifling their potential for empowerment and self-realization. In essence, the insidious nature of Baccha posh perpetuates a cycle of suppression and limitation, depriving these girls of the chance to embrace their uniqueness, assert their independence, and command the respect and recognition they inherently deserve in shaping their own destinies.

**Risk of Stigmatization:** Once the practice of Baccha posh transitioning back to living as a female takes place, the individual might encounter severe social repercussions in the form of stigma and social exclusion within their community. As they navigate the challenges of reintegrating into society, these individuals could find themselves grappling with feelings of isolation and emotional turmoil. Such difficult experiences can potentially hinder their ability to adjust and find their place within the social fabric, leading to prolonged psychological distress that may further exacerbate their struggle to effectively interact with others and rebuild meaningful relationships. The complex interplay between societal norms, personal identity, and cultural expectations can create barriers that impede the Baccha posh's journey towards acceptance and belonging, necessitating a concerted effort to address these multifaceted challenges and promote a supportive environment for their successful reintegration into the community as they embrace their authentic selves.

### **Conclusion**

Baccha posh, a traditional custom deeply embedded within certain cultural contexts, presents a complex blend of advantages and disadvantages for those involved. On the one hand, this practice, by allowing girls to temporarily adopt the identity and privileges associated with being male, can open doors to educational opportunities and economic advancements that might otherwise be inaccessible to them. However, the inherent dilemma lies in the perpetuation of gender inequality that Baccha Posh inadvertently promotes, posing a significant obstacle in the pursuit of true gender equity. Moreover, beyond the tangible benefits that may arise from participating in this practice, there exists a profound psychological burden that individuals must carry when navigating between two contrasting sets of gender expectations. The pressure to conform to traditional gender roles while also experiencing the temporary freedoms associated with the opposite gender can create internal conflict and confusion for those partaking in Baccha posh. In light of these complexities, it becomes clear that sustainable progress in dismantling the roots of gender discrimination

requires a concerted effort to empower girls through avenues that prioritize genuine gender equality. It is essential to redirect the focus towards challenging and dispelling harmful stereotypes that maintain the status quo, rather than perpetuating practices like Baccha posh that, although offering momentary advantages, ultimately reinforce societal norms that hinder the progress of women and perpetuate structural inequalities. By embracing a holistic approach that centers on advocating for gender parity and fostering an environment of inclusivity, we can work towards a future where every individual is afforded equal opportunities, free from the constraints imposed by outdated customs and beliefs.

### References:

1. Nordberg, Jenny. *The Underground Girls of Kabul: In Search of a Hidden Resistance in Afghanistan*. Crown, 2014.
2. "Bacha Posh: The Afghan Girls Who Live as Boys." BBC News, BBC, 29 Sept. 2010, [www.bbc.com/news/world-south-asia-11430550](http://www.bbc.com/news/world-south-asia-11430550).
3. "Bacha Posh: When Girls Become Boys." National Geographic, National Geographic Society, 17 Sept. 2012
4. Nordberg, Jenny. *The Underground Girls of Kabul: In Search of a Hidden Resistance in Afghanistan*. Crown, 2014.
5. "Bacha Posh: The Afghan Girls Who Live as Boys." BBC News, BBC, 29 Sept. 2010, [www.bbc.com/news/world-south-asia-11430550](http://www.bbc.com/news/world-south-asia-11430550).
6. "Bacha Posh: When Girls Become Boys." National Geographic, National Geographic Society, 17 Sept. 2012,
7. Corbos, Juliene, et al. 2019. *Bacha Posh in Afghanistan: factors associated with raising a girl as a boy*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691058.2019.1616113>.
8. Gosh, Ahmed H. 2003. "A History of Women in Afghanistan: Lessons Learnt for the Future or Yesterdays and Tomorrow: Women in Afghanistan." *Journal of International Women's Studies* 4 (3):1-14.
9. Hashimi, Nadia. 2014. *The Pearl that Broke its Shell*. HarperCollins Publishers, New York
10. Ganesh, L. 2013. *Women's Economic Empowerment in Afghanistan, 2003-2012: Information Mapping and*

Special Issue on Multidisciplinary Research

Situation Analysis. Kabul: Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit.

11. Marecek, Jeanne. 2017. Feminist Psychology. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118430873.est0124>