

Equality? The Importance Of Gender Mainstreaming Policies

Eha Saleha¹, Ida Widianingsih^{2&3},
Asep Sumaryana², Mas Halimah²

¹Public Administration, Universitas Padjadjaran,
Indonesia, eha18001@mail.unpad.ac.id

²Public Administration, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia

³Vice Dean Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia

Abstract

As a country with a large population and diverse ethnicities and cultures as well as religions, Indonesia needs to optimize gender equality through gender mainstreaming policies. Issues related to discrimination and gender disparity still occur in the realm of politics and women's leadership in various fields. Policy is an important factor to be prioritized in the development of gender mainstreaming in Indonesia which is interesting for further study. The results of the data analysis showed that there was no specific policy on gender mainstreaming yet. In addition, several laws did not have operational, institutional, and legal instruments in their implementation. Differences in the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming can also be found in the policies issued by the government. However, the government's efforts to allocate a gender-based budget support the implementation of gender mainstreaming which involves various stakeholders from the central government to local governments in Indonesia.

Keyword: Gender in Indonesia, Equality Gender, Public Policy, Women Leadership.

Introduction

The 2022 Global Gender Gap Report states that Indonesia has succeeded in reducing the gender gap, which was originally ranked 101st, now ranks 92nd in the world with a score of 0.697 out of 146 countries ("Global Gender Gap Report," 2022, p. 24). Various government programs for women's empowerment, protection of women and children, and gender mainstreaming are still being carried out intensively, but gender inequality still occurs in various

parts of the world, including Indonesia (Kementerian PPPA, 2019, p. 4). The world still needs 132 years to eliminate the gender gap in the world, even the world's SDGs report states that women still have to fight for 40 years for politics and national leadership (Nations, 2022, p. 12). Several previous studies reveal that women currently experience discrimination and stereotypes caused by various factors including the factors of religion (Mahmood, 2018) and culture (Prabu A & Gajendran A, n.d., p. 448), patriarchy (Firman Bobinsyah et al., n.d., p. 99; Walker & Madsen, 2017, McLaren, Star, Widianingsih, 2019), as well as the position of women in society as the second (Beauvoir, 2003) and the other (Lahti & Kelly, 1995). In addition, in the political and leadership, economic, and health sectors, it is still a challenge for leaders in every country in the world to take strategic steps to overcome inequality, including reducing gender inequality in their country.

The global challenge of gender inequality is driven by the women's movement which has prompted the Indonesian government to issue several policies and programs for gender mainstreaming. It started by ratifying the convention on the elimination of discrimination against women by issuing Law Number 7 of 1984 which ratified the world convention to eliminate all forms of discrimination against Women (Undang-Undang Nomor 7 Tahun 1984 Tentang Pengesahan Konvensi Mengenai Penghapusan Segala Bentuk Diskriminasi Terhadap Wanita, 1984). Several articles in Law Number 7 of 1984 discuss the elimination of discrimination against women in the fields of education and politics (articles 7, 8, 10) as well as gender equality in the workplace (article 11). Furthermore, the Indonesian government ratified the ILO convention to reduce discrimination against women in jobs and positions in 1999 by issuing Law Number 21 of 1999 (Undang-Undang Nomor 21 Tahun 1999 Tentang Pengesahan ILO Convention No. 111 Concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation, 1999).

The Indonesian government through the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection involves other ministries and various parties in overcoming discrimination against women and reducing the gap between women and men in Indonesia. Gender equality campaigns began to be echoed in various fields namely education, politics, health, and the economy, including Indonesia's participation in calling for an increase in the status of women at the Fourth World Women's Conference in Beijing in 1995. Ratification of the Beijing Platform for Action (BPFA) agreement requires the Indonesian government to report the progress of the

human development index and gender in Indonesia every 5 years (Kementerian PPPA, 2019, p. 1). The Government of Indonesia also fought for gender equality and justice in the 1999-2004 Indonesia Broad Guidelines of State Policy (GBHN) which reads: the position and role of women are increased in the every life sectors of the nation and state through the national policy of each institution, for the quality of the role and independence of women's organizations must be increased by maintaining the values of struggle and unity as well as the welfare of the family and society (Fithriyah, 2017, p. 60). Then, it was continued by The Ministry of Women's Empowerment by making a national development master plan for women's empowerment for 2000-2004 (Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2004 Tentang Penghapusan Kekerasan Dalam Rumah Tangga, 2004).

After a while, some public policies were ratified as government regulations which were the government's response to overcoming gender inequality, including in budget planning in each central ministry and local government. Some of these policies were issued by the government at the ministerial level, such as the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Home Affairs, and The Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, each of which issued regulations governing the implementation of gender mainstreaming (Kementerian PPPA, 2019, p. 6). However, gender issues are still constrained by many factors such as in the realm of politics and women's leadership (Tal & Gordon, 2018, p. 1) which are still the responsibilities of many parties. The low position of women in Indonesia is mostly caused by health problems, especially the high maternal and child mortality rates, low wages and work participation rates for women, women at risk of becoming illegal workers, low education for women, sexual, physical, and psychological violence, gender emergencies in disasters (Kementerian PPPA, 2019, pp. 22–34). Therefore, the implementation of gender mainstreaming requires implementation criteria regulated in the strategic plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection consisting of strong political commitment and institutional leadership, strategic policies, work programs, framework activities, clear Gender Mainstreaming monitoring and performance indicators, institutions, the establishment of working groups, driving teams (Technical Teams, Focal Points), competent human resources who acknowledge gender literacy (training, technical guidance, and advocacy), clear information systems and disaggregated data on gender analysis tools, community

participation (policies, programs in the context of equity and increasing understanding of Gender Mainstreaming in society) (Pemberdayaan et al., 2020, p. 29).

The challenges of implementing gender mainstreaming policies still occur nowadays even after almost 39 years since Indonesia ratified the International Convention on Women's Discrimination and 28 years since the Beijing Conference. However, there is no specific law that regulates the mainstreaming of women in Indonesia until now. It remains a big question for the government's commitment to gender mainstreaming in Indonesia; are the issued policies and regulations sufficient to be gender guidance in Indonesia?, What about the number of women occupying strategic positions in the political field who do not have the 30% quota as required by Law Number 7 of 2017 Concerning General Elections?. Likewise, the low level of top leaders in the field of education, especially universities in Indonesia. These questions are interesting to be correlated with the government's efforts to build gender mainstreaming by issuing various regulations to achieve gender equality in Indonesia.

Research Methods

The study of gender mainstreaming policy analysis in Indonesia is qualitative research. Document analysis research is part of qualitative research (Wolff, 2017). This research used documents drawn up by the central government in the form of laws drawn up by the House of The Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia, documents of presidential instructions or regulations drawn up by the President of the Republic of Indonesia, as well as ministerial regulations or decree on gender mainstreaming. The laws that were used as data were documents on gender mainstreaming in Indonesia from 1984 to 2020. Documents can be used as objects of research because these documents contain many sources of data (Woolgar S, 1980; Knorr-Cetina K D, 1981; Wolff, 2017). Documents are interpretations of social conditions that occur in an environment. (Smith D E, 1978; Wolff, 2017).

To obtain data, the researcher performed data mining on various websites belonging to the government of the Republic of Indonesia which are intended to digitally publish various kinds of laws and regulations. The researcher performed data mining on several databases, namely bpk.go.id, jdih.kemenpppa.go.id, jdih.bppk.kemenkeu.go.id, jdih.kemdikbud.go.id, and jdih.baliprov.go.id. The researcher used the keyword "gender mainstreaming policy" to find various kinds of data needed for

research. Data mining was carried out by the researcher for six months from July to December 2022. From the data mining results, the researcher obtained a total of 13 laws and regulations related to gender mainstreaming in Indonesia. The researcher obtained 6 documents in the bpk.go.id database, 3 documents in the jdih.kemenpppa.go.id database, 2 documents in the jdih.bppk.kemenkeu.go.id database, 1 document in the jdih.kemdikbud.go.id database, and 1 document data in the jdih.baliprov.go.id database.

Table 1. Data on Gender Mainstreaming Policies in Indonesia

Database	The Laws and Regulations Obtained
https://jdih.kemenpppa.go.id	The State Minister for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014, Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015, Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010
https://jdih.bppk.kemenkeu.go.id	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012, Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018
https://jdih.kemdikbud.go.id	The Minister of National Education Regulation Number 84 of 2008
https://jdih.baliprov.go.id	The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008
bpk.go.id	Law Number 23 of 2004, Law Number 7 of 1984, Law Number 21 of 1999, Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000, Law Number 6 of 2015, The Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 21 of 2020

(Source: Research 2023)

Then, gender mainstreaming laws and regulations in Indonesia obtained through data mining were analyzed. In conducting data analysis, the researcher used the concept of Miles and Huberman, namely collecting data, reducing data, presenting data, and drawing conclusions (Miles and Huberman, 1992). From the results of the analysis, it was found that the content of every law and regulation made by the government of the Republic of Indonesia from 1984 to 2020 has a different context. However, the contents of these regulations were drawn up to protect all aspects related

to gender mainstreaming. The results of the analysis that has been carried out are presented by dividing the results of the analysis into several categories which include (1) policy setting points, (2) institutional legal instruments and operational mechanisms, (3) stakeholders involved, (4) and the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming.

Results

The results of research on gender mainstreaming policies are presented starting from a discussion based on an analysis of the mapping regulations and setting points of policies issued by the Indonesian government. Then, the discussion continues on policy analysis based on institutional arrangements, operational mechanisms, and accompanying legal instruments. After that, the researcher discusses the stakeholders involved and the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming on policies related to gender mainstreaming in Indonesia.

Mapping Regulation on Gender Mainstreaming in Indonesia

The analysis of gender mainstreaming regulations in Indonesia begins with policy mapping based on the period in which the law was enacted and the content of policies related to gender mainstreaming which are handled directly by the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection. Gender mainstreaming policies in Indonesia began with the recognition of the Convention of the General Assembly of the United Nations on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women. It is stated in Law Number 7 of 1984 as a milestone in the recognition of gender equality in Indonesia. 14 years later in 1999, the Indonesian government recognized the results of the International Labor Organization (ILO) convention on guaranteeing the protection of workers from any discrimination in employment and occupation based on race, skin color, sex, religion, political opinion, nationality, and ancestry. It is stipulated in Law Number 21 of 1999.

Several women's movements and international conventions made the government aware to issue specific policies, not only to reduce discrimination against women but also to promote gender equality and opportunity in Indonesia. The policy is stipulated in Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000 on Gender Mainstreaming in national development and its technical guidelines. It becomes a notable history of the government's policy to support women in national development with a gender perspective according to the field of government institutions.

Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000 aims that every formulation, implementation, and evaluation of national development policies and programs incorporate the interests of gender equality.

4 years after the policy regulating women in the public sphere was issued, the government issued Law Number 23 of 2004 on the Elimination of Domestic Violence to protect women in the domestic or household sphere. It also guarantees to protect orders from the police to provide a sense of security for victims, especially women who experience physical and psychological misery and suffering due to coercion and deprivation of liberty which violate the law within the household sphere.

Women's protection policies in the domestic sphere still got the government's attention in 2004 but in 2008 the government began to pay attention to the involvement of women in the education sector. It is marked by the issuance of The Minister of Education Regulation Number 84 of 2008 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the education sector both at the central and regional levels. There has been a significant increase in the number of women undergoing education, as can be seen from the Global Gender Gap Report Data in 2022 where Indonesia is ranked 102nd country with high female participation rates in education ("Global Gender Gap Report," 2022, p. 28).

The government issued a policy as a general guideline regarding the implementation of gender mainstreaming in the field of political education in general elections through the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 27 of 2010. A year later, the Minister of Home Affairs issued Regulation Number 67 of 2011 concerning general guidelines which replaced the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on the implementation of gender mainstreaming in the regions. It stipulates that every arrangement of development policies, programs, and activities must be gender-responsive based on the results of gender analysis. Gender-responsive development requires budgetary support in its implementation so the Minister of Finance issued the Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012 on guidelines for preparing and reviewing work plans and budgets for ministries and state institutions.

Even though regulations and budgets have been made to be gender-responsive, gender equality has not been maximized. Therefore, in 2014, the government issued the Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 6 of 2014 on a national action plan to accelerate the

implementation of gender mainstreaming and children's rights through forums of religious organizations. This regulation involves the participation of religious organizations in carrying out gender mainstreaming activities and provides guidelines for each religious organization according to the needs, capabilities, and situation.

The policy was continued with the issuance of the Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015 on the strategic plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 5 years (2015-2019) starting from vision, mission, goals, strategies, policies and programs, activities, performance, and funding indicators. It is to optimize women's empowerment programs and child protection comprehensively. The Ministry of Finance even issued a Ministry of Finance Regulation Number. 807.KMK.01/2018 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Finance and serve as guidelines for gender equality programs in the Ministry of Finance at both central and regional levels. Likewise, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs has participated in carrying out gender mainstreaming with the issuance of the Minister of Foreign Affairs Regulation Number 21 of 2020 to guide apparatus at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in developing strategies for integrating gender in planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, program policies and field activities of foreign affairs. A more complete mapping of regulations regarding gender mainstreaming in Indonesia is presented in Table 1 below:

Table 2. Regulation Mapping on Gender Mainstreaming Policy in Indonesia

No	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
1	Law Number 7 of 1984 on Ratification of The Convention on The Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women	July 24, 1984	Indonesia ratified the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women which was approved by the General Assembly of the United Nations on December 18, 1979, except for Article 29 paragraph (1), results of the convention on the settlement of disputes regarding the interpretation or application of this Convention.

No	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
2	Law Number 21 of 1999 on ratification of the ILO Convention Number 111 in Respect of Discrimination in Employment and Occupation	May 7, 1999	<p>1. Indonesia accepted and ratified the ILO Convention on Discrimination in Employment and Occupation (ILO Convention Number 111 concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation) of which the original text is in English and translated into Indonesian which is attached as an integral part of this law.</p> <p>2. The purpose of ratifying the convention is to increase the effective protection and enforcement of the law so that it will guarantee the protection of workers' rights from any form of discrimination in employment and occupation.</p>
			3. Prohibit any form of discrimination in employment and occupation including in obtaining training and skills based on race, skin color, sex, religion, political opinion, nationality, or hereditary origin
3	Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000 on Gender Mainstreaming in national development as well as its technical instructions aims to include gender equality interests in the planning, implementation,	December 19, 2000	<p>1. Carrying out gender mainstreaming for planning, formulating, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs with a gender perspective in accordance with the respective fields of duties and functions, as well as their respective authorities</p> <p>2. State Minister for Women's Empowerment: a. Provide technical assistance to government agencies and institutions in implementing gender mainstreaming. b. Report the</p>

No	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
	monitoring, and evaluation of every national policy and program		<p>results of implementing gender mainstreaming to the president</p> <p>3. Heads of government agencies and institutions, both central and regional: a. establishing, appointing internal mechanism/work unit/person in charge. b. developing job descriptions and steps for implementing gender mainstreaming. c. carrying out internal coordination. d. providing technical assistance in the form of providing information, training, and consulting to those who need it.</p>
4	Law Number 23 of 2004 on the elimination of violence in the household	September 22, 2004	<p>1. In the household, violence is an act of a person against a woman which results in misery or suffering physically, psychologically, sexually, and/or neglect of the household including threats to commit acts, coercion, or unlawful deprivation of independence within the household sphere</p> <p>2. Guarantees for elimination, protection, and orders are issued from the police and complaints to provide a sense of security for victims</p>
5	The Minister of Education Regulation Number 84 of 2008 concerning guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the education	December 23, 2008	<p>1. Each work unit in the education sector carries out planning, monitoring, evaluation of all policies, development programs in the education sector to integrate gender</p> <p>2. Gender mainstreaming in the education sector in the national education department is carried out using the implementation guidelines</p>

N o	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
	sector to become guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in education at the central and regional levels		<p>as listed in the attachment to this ministerial regulation</p> <p>3. Education work units that are proven to carry out gender mainstreaming in the education sector that is not in accordance with the provisions referred to in Article 1 shall be subject to sanctions in accordance with laws regulations.</p>
6	The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010 on general guidelines for the implementation of gender mainstreaming in political education in general elections	December 19, 2010	<p>General Guidelines for Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in Political Education in Elections as a reference for the Directorate General of National Unity and Politics, Ministry of Home Affairs to integrate a gender perspective on mandatory and optional material in the administration of political education in elections</p> <p>Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in Political Education in Elections in the guidelines include</p> <p>a. Gender Mainstreaming prerequisites in the implementation of political education; b. Gender Mainstreaming implementation in the process of making political decisions; c. Gender Mainstreaming implementation in political administration; d. monitoring and evaluating Gender Mainstreaming implementation; and e. Gender Mainstreaming implementation reporting.</p>

No	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
7	The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on general guidelines for implementing Gender Mainstreaming in the regions	December 28, 2011	The regulations are intended for local governments to compile gender-responsive development policies, programs, and activities based on gender analysis as outlined in the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD), the Strategic and Work Plan of regional work units.
8	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012 on guidelines for preparing and reviewing work plans and budgets for state ministries/agencies	July 3, 2012	Guidelines for preparing gender-responsive budgets with good governance, sustainable development, and gender mainstreaming.
9	The State Minister for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014 on the National Action Plan to accelerate the	October 7, 2014	<p>1. Action plan involving the participation of religious organizations in carrying out gender mainstreaming and child rights activities throughout Indonesia, both in provinces, districts/cities, sub-districts, and villages until the family level.</p> <p>2. An action plan by providing a reference for each Religious Organization in compiling an Action Plan on Accelerating the Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming and Children's Rights</p>

No	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
	implementation of gender mainstreaming and children's rights through religious organization forums		based on the conditions, situations, needs, and abilities.
10	Law Number 6 of 2015 on Women's Empowerment and child protection systems	May 27, 2015	Women's Empowerment and Child Protection System is the entire process of implementing women's empowerment and child protection that is carried out comprehensively, inclusively, and integratively from the stage of handling reports/complaints, health services, social rehabilitation, law enforcement, and assistance, to repatriation and social reintegration for women and child victims
11	The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015 on the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 2015-2019	January 2015	Documents on the strategic plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 5 years consisting of vision, mission, objectives, strategies, and policies as well as programs, activities, performance indicators, and budgeting which are indicatively prepared based on the 2015-2019 national medium-term development plan

No	Regulation	Year	Setting Point
1	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Finance	December 7, 2018 Desember 2018	References for gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Finance
13	The Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 21 of 2020 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs		This guide aims to provide a reference for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs officials to develop a strategy for integrating gender starting from planning, budgeting, and implementation, until the monitoring and evaluation of programs, policies, and activities of foreign relations sectors.

Analysis of Gender Mainstreaming Policies in Indonesia

Tables 2 and 3 show 13 policies as the response of the Indonesian government to gender mainstreaming in Indonesia and reducing discrimination against women. The policies issued were multilevel starting from the issuance of 4 laws (Law Number 7 of 1984, Law Number 21 of 1999, Law Number 23 of 2004, Law Number 6 of 2015), 1 presidential instruction (Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000), 8 Ministerial regulations (The Minister of Education Regulation Number 84 of 2008, The Minister of Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 27 of 2010, The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011, The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012, The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 6 of 2014, The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child

Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015, The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018, The Minister of Foreign Affairs Regulation Number 21 of 2020).

It indicates that policies are taken in the realm of the central government as a result of formulations between the legislature and the judiciary that agree on gender mainstreaming and women's protection and empowerment. Policies are also issued at the executive level directly from presidential instructions and finally followed by regulations from ministries with their respective fields. Of the 13 policies issued by the government, 10 policies have legal instruments to explain and implement gender mainstreaming in Indonesia. This legal instrument provides more detailed policies regarding regulations issued by the Indonesian government.

In addition, of the 13 regulations issued, only 7 policies have institutional instruments in implementing gender mainstreaming policies and empowering and protecting women. Meanwhile, the operational mechanisms of the 13 regulations that emerged, only 10 policies had operational mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming policies in Indonesia. However, of the 13 regulations issued, many ministries and institutions were involved in the implementation process, which means that the implementation and development of gender equality into cross-sectoral government programs are also carried out starting from the central and regional levels.

Table 3. Category of Gender Mainstreaming Policy Analysis in Indonesia

	Regulation	Legal Instrument	Institutional Instrument	Operational Mechanism
1	Law Number 7 of 1984 on ratification of the convention regarding the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women	√		
2	Law Number 21 of 1999 on ratification of the ILO Convention Number 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation	√		
3	Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000 on gender mainstreaming in national development and its technical instructions	√	√	

	Regulation	Legal Instrument	Institutional Instrument	Operational Mechanism
4	Law Number 23 of 2004 on the elimination of domestic violence	√	√	√
5	The Minister of Education Number 84 of 2008 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the education sector	√	√	√
6	The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010 on general guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in political education in general elections	√	√	√
7	The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on general guidelines for the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the regions	√	√	√
8	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012 on guidelines for the preparation and review of work plans and budgets of state ministries/agencies			√
9	The State Minister for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014 on the national action plan to accelerate the implementation of gender and children's rights mainstreaming through religious organization forums	√	√	√
10	Law Number 6 of 2015 on Women's Empowerment and child protection systems	√	√	√
11	The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015 on the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of	√	√	√

	Regulation	Legal Instrument	Institutional Instrument	Operational Mechanism
	Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 2015-2019			
12	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Finance			√
13	The Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21 of 2020 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs	√		√

Stakeholders Involved in Gender Mainstreaming Policy in Indonesia

Gender mainstreaming cannot only be echoed by gender and women's activists, but it also requires the involvement of the government as the main actor, both the central and local governments. The gender mainstreaming policy issued by the government employs the actors in the implementation of women's empowerment policies in Indonesia from the central government including ministers, especially the State Minister For Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, the Minister of Finance, the Minister of Foreign Affairs, the Minister of Home Affairs, the Minister of Public Works and Public Housing, and several ministries of the Republic of Indonesia, the director general, echelon 1 and 2 officials, the highest state institution, the Commander of the Indonesian National Army, the Head of the Indonesian National Police, the Directorate General of National Unity and Politics, the Ministry of Home Affairs, Gender Mainstreaming Coordinator of the Foreign Ministry, Director General for Community and Village Empowerment, the Central Election Commission, the Central Work Unit, the Central Election Supervisory Agency, political parties, and the Attorney General of the Republic of Indonesia. Moreover, stakeholders involved in the regions are governors, regents/mayors, courts, Regional Election Commissions, Regional Election Supervisory Agencies, health workers, social workers, advocates, companion volunteers, spiritual mentors, education offices, education branch offices, education units, activists of gender mainstreaming activities in the education sector, gender

mainstreaming working groups in the education sector, integrated service centers for the empowerment of women and children, regional apparatus, sub-district heads, village heads, Gender Mainstreaming focal points, gender mainstreaming working groups, and religious organizations.

Apart from the government, there is a committee for eliminating discrimination against women which was formed in 1982. Until now, many stakeholders outside the government who have not stopped calling for gender equality include women activists and leaders who fight for women by empowering and protecting them directly through non-governmental organizations/NGOs or through their own organizations.

Table 4. Stakeholders Involved in Gender Mainstreaming Policy in Indonesia

No	Regulation	Stakeholder
1	Law Number 7 of 1984 on ratification of the convention regarding the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women	Committee for the Elimination of discrimination against women
2	Law Number 21 of 1999 on ratification of the ILO Convention Number 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation	Director General of the International Labor Office
3	Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000 on gender mainstreaming in national development and its technical instructions	State Minister for Women's Empowerment; Minister of all ministries in the Indonesian government, Head of Non-Departmental Government Institutions; Head of the Secretariat of the State's Highest Institution; Commander of the Indonesian National Armed Forces; Head of Police for the Republic of Indonesia; Attorney General of the Republic of Indonesia; governors, regents/mayors
4	Law Number 23 of 2004 on the elimination of domestic violence	The central and regional government, police, courts, health workers, social workers, advocates, companion volunteers, spiritual guides
5	The Minister of Education Number 84 of 2008 on guidelines for	Central work units, Governors, Education Office, Education Branch Offices, Education Units, Gender Mainstreaming Activist in the Education

No	Regulation	Stakeholder
	implementing gender mainstreaming in the education sector	Sector, Gender Mainstreaming Working Groups in the Education Sector Unit
6	The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010 on general guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in political education in general elections	Directorate General of National Unity and Politics of the Ministry of Home Affairs, Regional Election Commissions, Regional Election Supervisory Agencies, Political Parties
7	The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on general guidelines for the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the regions	Minister of Home Affairs through the Director General of Community and Village Empowerment, Regional Planning Agencies, governors, regents, mayors, and regional apparatus, sub-district heads, village heads, Gender Mainstreaming focal points, gender mainstreaming working groups
8	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012 on guidelines for the preparation and review of work plans and budgets of state ministries/agencies	Ministers, heads of institutions, echelon 1 officials,
9	The State Minister for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014 on the national action plan to accelerate the implementation of gender and children's rights mainstreaming through religious organization forums	Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection, a religious organization
10	Law Number 6 of 2015 on Women's Empowerment and child protection systems	Integrated Service Center for Empowerment of Women and Children, local government
11	The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015 on the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 2015-2019	echelon 1 and II ministries and institutional units
12	The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018 on guidelines for implementing gender	Echelon 1/ leader of vertical work unit/leader of the technical unit, working group/Gender Mainstreaming team

No	Regulation	Stakeholder
	mainstreaming in the Ministry of Finance	
13	The Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21 of 2020 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Minister of Foreign Affairs and Gender Mainstreaming Coordinator of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Meaning of Gender and Gender Mainstreaming in Gender Mainstreaming Regulations in Indonesia

Empowering women who are equal to men is a top priority for gender mainstreaming policies which are general guidelines and a form of the government's alignment with gender equality in the public and domestic spheres. However, the important topic to be observed from every gender mainstreaming regulation in Indonesia is the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming which reflects the understanding of the actors who formulate and implement gender mainstreaming policies. From several published policies, it is known that 6 regulations do not directly state the meaning of gender in it as well as 6 other regulations that also do not state the meaning of gender mainstreaming as shown below.

1. 6 Regulations that do not state the meaning of gender namely
 - a. Law Number 7 of 1984 on ratification of the convention regarding the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women.
 - b. Law Number 21 of 1999 on ratification of the ILO convention Number 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation
 - c. Law Number 23 of 2004 on the elimination of domestic violence.
 - d. The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on general guidelines for the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the regions
 - e. Law Number 6 of 2015 on women's empowerment and child protection systems.
 - f. The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015 on the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 2015-2019

2. 6 Regulations that do not state the meaning of gender mainstreaming namely
 - a. Law Number 7 of 1984 on ratification of the convention regarding the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women.
 - b. Law Number 21 of 1999 on ratification of the ILO Convention Number 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation.
 - c. Law Number 23 of 2004 on the elimination of domestic violence.
 - d. The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on general guidelines for the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the regions
 - e. The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012 on guidelines for the preparation and review of work plans and budgets of state ministries/agencies
 - f. Law Number 6 of 2015 concerning women's empowerment and child protection systems.

In addition, there are several different meanings or definitions of gender and gender mainstreaming in the issued regulations as follows.

1. Definition of gender
 - a. The concept refers to the roles and responsibilities of men and women that occur as a result of and can be changed by the social and cultural conditions of society (Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000, Minister of Education Regulation Number 84 of 2008, Minister of Women Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010, The State Minister for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014)
 - b. The roles and status of men or women are based on social and cultural construction which is influenced by the broader structure of society and can change according to the times, not based on biological differences (The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018).
 - c. Differences in nature, roles, functions, and status between men and women are not based on biological differences but based on sociocultural relations that are influenced by the broader structure of society (The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012, Minister of Foreign

Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 21 of 2020)

2. Definition of gender mainstreaming

According to several policies issued by the government, the definition of gender mainstreaming is presented as follows:

- a. The strategy built to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs (Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000, Minister of Education Regulation Number 84 of 2008, Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010, Minister of State For Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014, Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 21 of 2020)
- b. Strategies that are carried out rationally and systematically to achieve justice and gender equality in aspects of human life through policies and programs by considering the experiences, aspirations, needs, and problems of women and men and the elderly, children under age, people with special needs and people who are not stable economically to empower women and men starting from the stages of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, evaluating all policies, programs, activities in various fields of national development (Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015)
- c. Strategies to achieve justice and gender equality through policies, programs, and activities by considering the experiences, aspirations, needs, and problems of men and women in the process of planning, budgeting, and implementing as well as monitoring and evaluating all aspects of life and development (Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807. KMK.01/2018)

Based on the abovementioned definitions, the definition of gender mainstreaming in point b is more comprehensive in explaining gender mainstreaming as a strategy, which is rational and systematic to achieve gender equality and justice for both men and women through policies and programs that are integrated into planning, budgeting, implementation and evaluation in various fields of national development.

Table 5. The Meaning of Gender and Gender Mainstreaming in Gender Mainstreaming Regulations in Indonesia

Regulation	The Meaning of Gender	The Meaning of Gender Mainstreaming
Law Number 7 of 1984 on ratification of the convention regarding the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women		
Law Number 21 of 1999 on ratification of the ILO Convention Number 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation		
Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2000 on gender mainstreaming in national development and its technical instructions	The concept refers to the roles and responsibilities of men and women that occur as a result of and can be changed by the social and cultural conditions of society	The strategy is built to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs
Law Number 23 of 2004 on the elimination of domestic violence		
The Minister of Education Number 84 of 2008 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the education sector	A concept that refers to the different roles and responsibilities of men and women that occur as a result of and can be changed by the social and cultural conditions of society	The strategy is built to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs in the education field
The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 27 of 2010 on general guidelines for implementing gender	A concept that refers to the different roles and responsibilities of men and women that occur as a result of and can be changed by the social and cultural conditions of society	The strategy is built to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs

Regulation	The Meaning of Gender	The Meaning of Gender Mainstreaming
mainstreaming in political education in general elections		
The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2011 amendment to The Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 15 of 2008 on general guidelines for the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the regions		
The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 112/PMK.01/2012 on guidelines for the preparation and review of work plans and budgets of state ministries/agencies	Differences in nature, roles, functions, and status between men and women are not based on biological differences but based on sociocultural relations that are influenced by the broader structure of society	
The State Minister for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia Regulation Number 6 of 2014 on the national action plan to accelerate the implementation of gender and children's rights mainstreaming through religious organization forums	A concept that refers to the different roles and responsibilities of men and women that occur as a result of and can be changed by the social and cultural conditions of society	The strategy is built to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs
Law Number 6 of 2015 on Women's Empowerment and child protection systems		

Regulation	The Meaning of Gender	The Meaning of Gender Mainstreaming
<p>The Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015 on the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection for 2015-2019</p>		<p>Strategies that are carried out rationally and systematically to achieve justice and gender equality in aspects of human life through policies and programs that pay attention to the experiences, aspirations, needs, and problems of women and men and the elderly, children under age, people with special needs and people who are not stable economically to empower women and men starting from the stages of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, evaluating all policies, programs, activities in various fields of national development</p>
<p>The Minister of Finance Regulation Number 807.KMK.01/2018 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Finance</p>	<p>The roles and status of men or women are based on social and cultural construction which is influenced by the broader structure of society and can change according to the times, not based on biological differences</p>	<p>Strategies to achieve justice and gender equality through policies, programs, and activities by considering the experiences, aspirations, needs, and problems of men and women in the process of planning, budgeting, and implementing as well as monitoring and evaluating all aspects of life and development</p>
<p>The Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21 of 2020 on guidelines for implementing gender mainstreaming in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs</p>	<p>Differences in nature, roles, functions, and status between men and women are not based on biological differences but based on sociocultural relations that are influenced by the broader structure of society</p>	<p>The strategy is built to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating policies, programs, and activities of foreign affairs.</p>

Discussion

The explanation on gender mainstreaming based on the several tables above shows the data in the form of laws, presidential instructions, and ministerial regulations that originate from policies on the protection of women that were issued because of pressure from the international movement to eliminate discrimination against women, not because of the insistence on women's issues in Indonesia. The data also indicate that the gender mainstreaming policies also involve various stakeholders and are carried out cross-sectorally by several ministries, from the central government to regional governments, communities, and the private sector. However, the involvement of the central and regional governments as well as the community and the private sector is still constrained by the perceptions of the actors in charge who understand the meaning of gender differently, including the definition of gender mainstreaming. In addition, several policies issued by the government do not state the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming so it can be a factor in the lack of understanding of stakeholders involved in implementing gender mainstreaming policies. Evaluation of the gender mainstreaming implementation in 18 ministries/agencies, 7 provinces, and 7 selected districts/cities in 2007 showed that gender mainstreaming had not been implemented properly in most developments so gender perspective budgeting was proposed (Fithriyah, 2017, pp. 61–62).

Furthermore, the previous explanation of the meaning of gender is divided into 3 different meanings, namely gender is a concept of roles and responsibilities that can be changed according to social and cultural circumstances. The second definition of gender is about the roles and status attached to men and women that can change and become social constructions, no longer about a concept. An even more convincing definition is the third definition of gender concerns differences in roles, characteristics, status, and functions based on social relations not because of biological differences between men and women. However, these definitions are in the same vein that roles can change not based on the biological differences inherent in men and women. It is similar to an expert opinion about gender that it is social sex with feminism and masculine attributes resulting from the social and cultural construction of society (Maggie, 2002, pp. 177–178).

Subsequent data presents the notion of gender mainstreaming, but it is found that there are differences in definition, so the researcher considers point b to be more comprehensive, the

meaning contained in the Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 1 of 2015, to be more comprehensive. However, the definition of gender mainstreaming according to the United Nations that gender mainstreaming is a process and strategy for assessing every action on women and men that is planned, implemented, and evaluated in regulations, programs, or policies issued by the government to achieve gender equality (United, n.d., p. 2). The definition of gender mainstreaming stated by the Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Number 15 and in the 2017 Beijing conference report has almost the same meaning that a strategy integrates gender in planning, implementing, and evaluating programs and policies issued by the government.

Conclusion

The implementation of gender mainstreaming has been carried out 39 years since the publication of the first policy in 1984. However, the first policy issued did not regulate gender mainstreaming but discussed the recognition of international conventions on eliminating discrimination against women. After that, the Indonesian government issued 12 policies related to gender mainstreaming to achieve gender equality. The gender mainstreaming policy is a strategy to integrate gender in all areas of development by involving various stakeholders from the central government to regional governments, the private sector, and the community.

Gender equality through 13 policies issued by the government, not all of which have legal instruments, institutional instruments, and operational mechanisms to implement gender mainstreaming policies in Indonesia. Several regulations also do not address gender and gender mainstreaming. Likewise, the meaning of gender is different in every policy concerning gender mainstreaming and women's empowerment. The government's efforts in planning, implementing, and evaluating gender mainstreaming have been supported by a gender perspective budget. However, in reality, there are still a number of fields such as higher education that are still in a crisis of female leaders, as well as the political sector. In addition, domestic violence is increasing and the death of pregnant women during childbirth is still high. It implies that the government and several stakeholders involved must have a strong commitment and political support, and the budget needs to be more optimal in implementing gender mainstreaming in Indonesia. This research is limited to examining

gender mainstreaming policies at the central level, so further research is expected to examine gender mainstreaming in the regions and several fields, such as universities and political parties.

Reference

1. Beauvoir, D. S. (2003). *Second Sex, Fakta dan Mitos*. Pustaka Prometea.
2. Firman Bobinsyah, M., Putra, F., & Riniwati, H. (n.d.). Environment Based Women's Empowerment as a response to Resouces Scarcity in Sumberagung Village, Pesanggaran Banyuwangi. <https://doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/72ECA>
3. Fithriyah. (2017). Indonesia's Experience: Implementing Gender Responsive Planning and Budgeting. In *Jurnal Perencanaan Pembangunan The Indonesian Journal of Dev. Planning* (Vol. 1, Issue 1).
4. Global Gender Gap Report. (2022). In World Economic Forum. <https://www.weforum.org/reports/global-gender-gap-report-2022/>
5. Kementerian PPPA. (2019). *Laporan Beijing Platform for Action (BPfA) +25 Indonesia (2014-2019)*. Kementerian PPPA.
6. Knorr-Cetina K D. (1981). *The Manufacture of Knowledge An Essay on The Constructivist and Contextual Nature of Science*. Pergamon Press.
7. Lahti, G. D., & Kelly, R. M. (1995). On Governance, Leadership, and Gender. In R. M. Lahti, G.D. & Kelly (Ed.), *Gender Power, Leadership, and Governance* (p. 13). The USA:University Of Michigan Press.
8. Maggie, H. (2002). *Ensiklopedia Feminisme*. Fajar Pustaka.
9. Mahmood, A. (2018). The Part of Leadership for Women in Pakistan. In C. R. Rachel M.N & Elizabeth (Ed.), *Women Leading Education Across The Continents Book Series* (p. 337). Rowman & Littlefield.
10. McLaren, H., Star, C., & Widianingsih, I. (2019). Indonesian Women in Public Service Leadership: A Rapid Review. *Social Science*, 8(11) 308-1-308-16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci8110308>
11. Miles M B, & Huberman A M. (1992). *Analisis Data Kualitatif Buku Sumber Tentang Metode-Metode Baru*. Universitas Indonesia.
12. Nations, U. (2022). *The sustainable development goals report 2022*.
13. Pemberdayaan, K., Dan, P., & Anak, P. (2020). *Rencana Strategis Deputi Bidang Kesetaraan Gender*.
14. Prabu A, & Gajendran A. (n.d.). Cause and Effect of Difference in Gender-Wise Perceptions on Investor's Investment. <https://doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/AHY64>
15. Smith D E. (1978). K is Mentally Ill The Anatomy of a Factual Account. *Sociology*, 12(1), 23–53.
16. Tal, D., & Gordon, A. (2018). Women as Political Leaders: a Bibliometric Analysis of the Literature. *Society*, 55(3), 256–261. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12115-018-0248-8>

17. Undang-undang Nomor 7 Tahun 1984 tentang pengesahan konvensi mengenai penghapusan segala bentuk diskriminasi terhadap wanita, (1984).
18. Undang-undang Nomor 21 tahun 1999 tentang pengesahan ILO convention no. 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation (No. 21). (1999).
19. Undang-Undang Nomor 23 tahun 2004 tentang penghapusan kekerasan dalam rumah tangga. (2004).
20. United, N. (n.d.). Gender Mainstreaming Extract from Report of the Economic and Social Council for 1997 (A/52/3, 18 September 1997) Chapter IV Coordination Segment Coordination of the Policies and Activities of the Specialized agencies and other Bodies of the United Nations System.
21. Walker, S. J., & Madsen, S. R. (2017). The Women and Leadership Theory Think Tank Report 2015. Report, 17. <https://www.uvu.edu/uwlp/docs/wlthinktankreport2015.pdf>
22. Wolff, S. (2017). A. D. dan Rekaman. I. B. I. P. K. P. T. M. P. dan Praktik. E. by F. U. , K. E. (2017). Analisis Dokumen dan Rekaman. In Flick U, Kardoff E V, & Steinke I (Eds.), Buku Induk Penelitian Kualitatif: Paradigma Teori Metode Prosedur dan Praktik (pp. 677–690). Cantrik Pustaka.
23. Woolgar S. (1980). Discovery Logic and Sequence in a Scientific Text. In Knorr W R, Krohn R, & Whitely R P (Eds.), The Social Process of Scientific Investigation Sociology of The Science: Vol. IV (IV, pp. 239–268). Springer Dordrecht.